

Fwd: Independent Review Report Submitted - 929697

Muhammad Ramaditya <muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id>  
kepada saya

04.30 (4 menit yang lalu)

Inggris Indonesia Terjemahkan pesan

Nonaktifkan untuk: Inggris

Forwarded message

From: Frontiers in Education Editorial Office <education\_editorial\_office@frontiersin.org>  
Date: Fri, Jul 22, 2022, 9:42 PM  
Subject: Independent Review Report Submitted - 929697  
To: Muhammad Ramaditya <muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id>

Dear Dr Ramaditya,

A new review report has been submitted by a Reviewer 2. Once the other Reviewer(s) have submitted their comments, you will be granted access to the reports in the review forum, so that you can begin your revisions. Please be ready to respond and revise your manuscript promptly when they do.

Please click here to access this manuscript directly:  
<http://review.frontiersin.org/review/929697/0/0>

Manuscript title: Reinventing Talent Management: How to Maximize Performance in the Higher Education  
Manuscript ID: 929697  
Authors: Muhammad Ramaditya, Mohamed Syamsul Maarif, Joko Afandi and Anggraini Sukmawati  
Journal: Frontiers in Education, section Higher Education  
Article type: Original Research  
Submitted on: 27 Apr 2022

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Education team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team  
[www.frontiersin.org](http://www.frontiersin.org)  
Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34, 1005 Lausanne, Switzerland  
Office T 41 21 510 1793

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk ([support@frontiersin.org](mailto:support@frontiersin.org)) or visit our Frontiers Help Center ([zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us](https://zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us))

\*\*\*\*\*

Independent Review Report, Reviewer 2

**EVALUATION**

Please list your revision requests for the authors and provide your detailed comments, including highlighting limitations and strengths of the study and evaluating the validity of the methods, results, and data interpretation. If you have additional comments based on Q2 and Q3 you can add them as well.

**Introduction:**

How is the performance in education faced by higher education in Indonesia today and what disruptions do they face? Explain in the introduction. How interesting is the situation in Indonesia for international researchers to read?

**Hypothesis development:**

The explanation of the first hypothesis development, namely "Talent management is positively related to knowledge management" is less clear. Please give strong literature support.

**Samples:**

Why is the sample size 382? How to determine the number and how is random sampling done? Why can the sample in the city of Jakarta be generalized to Indonesia?

**Variables:**

Please explain in detail the measurement of variables and indicators of each variable so that this research can be replicated

**Discussion :**

1. We recommend that the discussion be more in-depth.
2. Written in the conclusion: "This research provides a new strategic perspective in understanding the current conditions". Please explain in the discussion section what the intended strategy is.

**Suggestion :**

Give suggestions for practical managerial as well as for future research

**Reference :**

There are some very old references. If there is, use the latest one.

**Check List**

a. Is the quality of the figures and tables satisfactory?

Yes

b. Does the reference list cover the relevant literature adequately and in an unbiased manner?

Yes

c. Are the statistical methods valid and correctly applied? (e.g. sample size, choice of test)

Yes

4 dari 358 < > ✎

Fwd: Independent Review Report Submitted - 929697 Kotak Masuk x



**Muhammad Ramaditya** <muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id>

kepada saya ▾

04:30 (6 menit yang lalu) ☆ ↶ ⋮

🌐 Inggris ▾ > Indonesia ▾ [Terjemahkan pesan](#)

[Nonaktifkan untuk Inggris](#) x

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Frontiers in Education Editorial Office** <[education\\_editorial\\_office@frontiersin.org](mailto:education_editorial_office@frontiersin.org)>

Date: Sat, Jul 16, 2022, 2:48 PM

Subject: Independent Review Report Submitted - 929697

To: Muhammad Ramaditya <[muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id](mailto:muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id)>

Dear Dr Ramaditya,

A new review report has been submitted by a Reviewer 1. Once the other Reviewer(s) have submitted their comments, you will be granted access to the reports in the review forum, so that you can begin your revisions. Please be ready to respond and revise your manuscript promptly when they do.

Please click here to access this manuscript directly:

<http://review.frontiersin.org/review/929697/0/0>

Manuscript title: Reinventing Talent Management: How to Maximize Performance in the Higher Education

Manuscript ID: 929697

Authors: Muhammad Ramaditya, Mohamad Syamsul Maarif, Joko Afandi and Angraini Sukmawati

Journal: Frontiers in Education, section Higher Education

Article type: Original Research

Submitted on: 27 Apr 2022

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Education team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team

[www.frontiersin.org](http://www.frontiersin.org)

Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34, 1006 Lausanne, Switzerland

Office T 41 21 510 1793

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk ([support@frontiersin.org](mailto:support@frontiersin.org)) or visit our Frontiers Help Center ([zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us](https://zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us))

\*\*\*\*\*  
Independent Review Report, Reviewer 1

EVALUATION

Please list your revision requests for the authors and provide your detailed comments, including highlighting limitations and strengths of the study and evaluating the validity of the methods, results, and data interpretation. If you have additional comments based on Q2 and Q3 you can add them as well.

Thank you very much for the opportunity to read this interesting paper. It has provided additional knowledge for me personally, thank you so much for the authors. Issues related to improving university performance are indeed a current issue, especially in Indonesia. That is not only seen from the point of view of the educational management discipline, but also from the management, business, and accounting. Nonetheless, despite the contribution of this paper, some improvements are still needed. The suggestions presented are only based on my personal understanding, therefore this is not something absolute.

In the title, the authors use the "higher education institutions" term. But in the abstract and text sometimes they mentioned the "university" word. Please be consistent in terms of the word term that would be used.

Abstract

"The purpose of this study was to explain how ..." Unfortunately quantitative research is not intended to answer the 'How' research question as it is a responsibly qualitative research approach. The claim should be revised into " This study examines the role of A,B,C variable on Y variable .....so on.

"Furthermore, the data were analyzed using SmartPLS software". Instead of explaining the tool authors used in the abstract, it is more important to mention the statistical technique utilized, in this case, Structural Equation Modelling-Partial Least Square (SEM-PLS).

Introduction

Some studies claim a solid link between talent and knowledge management (Sparrow & Makram, 2015; Oigwelem, 2017; Paisey & Paisey, 2018; Mohammed, 2018; Abdullah Mohammed et al., 2020) (Miro & Otham, 2018).....the citation needs to be repaired.

However, no studies have discussed the relationship between talent management, knowledge management, university transformation, and academic climate.....using the "no studies" word seems overconfident. It would be wiser if the authors use humble claims such as there is a lack of studies examining.....so on.

In this part, the authors need to justify why they are concerned with private HEI instead of public one or both. Why is the concern to QS world university ranking as benchmarking in the last paragraph of the introduction?

I also suggest explaining the research contribution in this part both theoretically and practically.

Literature review

No issue, looks good

Methodology

This study targeted 299 private universities... why 299? need justification regarding sample size.

Please do a common method variance test to ensure this kind of bias does not threaten the validity of the study results.



3 dari 258 < > ✎



**Muhammad Ramaditya** <muhammadramaditya@apps.icb.ac.id>  
kepada saya ▾

04.30 (7 menit yang lalu) ☆ ↶

🗣 Ingggris ▾ > Indonesia ▾ Terjemahkan pesan

Nonaktifkan untuk: Ingggris ✕

----- Forwarded message -----

From: **Frontiers in Education Editorial Office** <education\_editorial\_office@frontiersin.org>  
Date: Mon, Jul 25, 2022, 9:42 PM  
Subject: Action needed: Interactive review for your manuscript has been activated automatically - 929697  
To: Muhammad Ramaditya <muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id>

Dear Dr Ramaditya,

The interactive review of your manuscript "Reinventing Talent Management: How to Maximize Performance in the Higher Education" submitted to Frontiers in Education, section Higher Education has now been activated.

Please respond by 01 Aug 2022 to all comments raised by the reviewers and editor in the online review forum. If a reviewer has finalized the review and discussion on the Reviewer tab is closed, you should submit a reply to pending comments in a new thread in the Editor tab. If necessary, you can also submit a revised version of your manuscript at that time. We encourage you to submit your documents with tracked changes to highlight the revisions.

To access the review forum and respond to the reviewers, please click on the following link:  
<http://review.frontiersin.org/review/929697/0/0>

Best regards,

Your Frontiers in Education team

Frontiers | Editorial Office - Collaborative Peer Review Team  
[www.frontiersin.org](http://www.frontiersin.org)  
Avenue du Tribunal Fédéral 34, 1005 Lausanne, Switzerland  
Office T 41 21 510 1793

For technical issues, please contact our IT Helpdesk ([support@frontiersin.org](mailto:support@frontiersin.org)) or visit our Frontiers Help Center ([zendesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us](https://zenDesk.frontiersin.org/hc/en-us))

Manuscript title: Reinventing Talent Management: How to Maximize Performance in the Higher Education  
Manuscript ID: 929697  
Authors: Muhammad Ramaditya, Mohamad Syamsul Maarif, Joko Alfandi and Angraini Sukmawati  
Journal: Frontiers in Education, section Higher Education  
Article type: Original Research  
Submitted on: 27 Apr 2022





**Muhammad Ramaditya** <muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id>  
kepada saya ▾

🗑️ Inggris ▾ > Indonesia ▾ Terjemahkan pesan

Nonaktifkan untuk Inggris ✕

----- Forwarded message -----  
From: **Education Production Office** <education.production.office@frontiersin.org>  
Date: Thu, Sep 1, 2022, 3:24 PM  
Subject: Frontiers: You've got a message from the type-setters  
To: <muhammadramaditya@apps.ipb.ac.id>

Education Production Office has sent you a message. Please click 'Reply' to send a direct response

Dear Muhammad Ramaditya,

The type-setter has posted the following message in the proof discussion of your article "Reinventing Talent Management: How to Maximize Performance in the Higher Education" (10.3389/feduc.2022.929697):

-----  
QAQ: Reference Query

Dear Authors,

Thank you very much for submitting your corrections and we are working on them. We request the following information to proceed with the production.

Q11: Please add the following reference "Sulikowski et al., 2019" to the Reference List.

Q19: Please cite the tables "Tables 5 and 6" in the text. Note that the tables and figures citations must be cited in sequential order.

Q28: Please cite the following reference "Kaliannan et al., 2016" in the text.

We look forward to your reply to proceed further and please let us know if there are any questions.

PS: Make sure to reply directly in the production forum using the link.

Best Regards,  
Frontiers Production